

From 1 January 2014

Transitional Sentencing Provisions: Each of the two tables is divided into thirds based on the three relevant periods of Sentencing Provisions:

- Post-transitional provisions period
- Transitional provisions period
- Pre-transitional provisions period

These periods are separated by a row which shows when the transitional provisions were enacted, and another showing when they were repealed.

Glossary:

poss possess ct count

CSI conditional suspended imprisonment

TES total effective sentence elec comm electronic communication CEM child exploitation material

No.	Case	Antecedents	Summary/Facts	Sentence	Appeal
5.	HJT v The State	35 yrs at time offending.	6 x Using elec comm to expose a person believed to	12 mths imp each ct	Allowed.
	of Western		be U16 yrs to indec matter.	(conc).	
	Australia	Convicted after PG (20%			Appeal concerned length of
		discount).	The offences took place on six separate occasions,	TES 12 mths imp.	sentence; errors in not susp the
	[2020] WASCA		over a period of about 10 wks.		term of imp and degree of
	120	No prior criminal history.		EFP.	hardship on family.
			HJT joined a chat application. He engaged in online		
	Delivered	Happy; affectionate childhood.	conversations with police officers who had adopted	Sentenced on the basis	New evidence Appellant's imp
	30/07/2020		child personas.	the appellant did not	has had immediate and
		Married; two young sons; one		intend to actually meet	noticeable detrimental impact
		child 'C' diagnosed with high-	<u>Cts 1 -5</u>	the child personas; had	on child 'C' and his mother.
		functioning autism spectrum	The child persona the subject of these cts was said	no intention of	
		disorder; wife C's full-time carer	to be 14 yrs of age.	engaging in physical	Resentenced to 12 mths imp
		and unable to return to work;		conduct with children.	each ct; susp 12 mths.
		struggled financially.	HJT asked the child persona sexually explicit		
			questions.	The sentencing judge	At [67] his Honour was not
		Supportive family.	, O >	found the provision of	properly informed of very
			On two occasions HJT also sent the child persona	videos and	important facts in relation to
		Dyslexic; completed yr 12;	photographs of himself in tracksuit pants displaying	photographs to the	C's autism, including the very
		university studies.	his covered erect penis.	child personas went	significant impact of the
				'above and beyond the	appellant's incarceration on
		Consistently employed as an	HJT also sent the child persona three internet web-	graphic chat logs that	C's condition. The new
		accountant; family's sole	links to pornographic videos telling her she needed	are exchanged'; the	evidence shows that C's
		breadwinner.	to watch them.	appellant	condition has very
				misrepresented his age	significantly regressed since
		X	<u>Ct 6</u>	as being 23 yrs and	the appellant's incarceration in
			The child persona the subject of this ct was said to	there was a significant	a way which was not foreseen
			be 13 yrs old.	disparity between his	at the sentencing
				actual age and the age	
			During conversations with this child persona HJT	of the child personas.	At [68] It may now be seen
		. (9	made a series of sexually explicit comments and		that the nature and extent of
		CAU	very similar questions to those he had asked the	The sentencing judge	the impact of the appellant's

_		1			
			child persona the subject of cts 1 to 5.	took into account the	imp on C is such as to bring
				appellant's 'very	the present case within that
			HJT also sent the child persona two internet web-	difficult family	rare category where
			links, inviting her to view two videos depicting a	circumstances', but	exceptional hardship to an
			male and female engaging in oral sex and full	concluded the	offender's family becomes a
			sexual intercourse.	offending was too	mitigating factor. We have
				serious to permit him	been persuaded that a
			O^	to take into account	miscarriage of justice has
				the hardship that	occurred
				would be caused by	
				the appellant's	At [70] we record that,
				incarceration; to susp	absent the exceptional level of
			10 Y	the term would be a	hardship to C, we would not
				failure of public duty.	have intervened to impose
				failure of public duty.	sentences different from those
			C. V	Very low risk of future	imposed at first instance
			X	reoffending; genuinely	the mercy of the court has
			Oy	remorseful; very good	been extended having regard
				prospects of	to the welfare of C and not as a
				rehabilitation;	benefit to the appellant.
			· rector of h	voluntarily engaged in	benefit to the appenant.
				psychological	
				counselling;	
				commenced internet	
				sex offender treatment	
			Y		
4.	Vucemillo v The	24 yrs at time sentencing.	Ct 1: Using elec comm to procure a child to engage	program. Ct 1: 2 yrs imp.	Dismissed.
4.	State of Western	24 yrs at time sentencing.	in sexual activity or expose a child to indec matter.	Ct 1: 2 yrs imp. Ct 2: 6 mths imp cum.	Disillissed.
	•	Consists 1 should 1		Ct 2: 6 mins mip cum.	A1
	Australia	Convicted after trial.	Ct 2: Poss CEM.	TEC 2 sum 6 modes in a	Appeal concerned a
	[2017] XXA C.C.A	No paign original history	C+ 1	TES 2 yrs 6 mths imp. EFP.	miscarriage of justice due to
	[2017] WASCA	No prior criminal history.	Ct 1	EFP.	subsequent diagnosis of autism
	37	Demonts d'account	Vucemillo placed an online advertisement on	The sentence of the	spectrum disorder, and totality.
	D 1' 1	Parents divorced; second eldest of	Craiglist looking for ' any young girls that want	The sentencing judge	Individual sentences were not
	Delivered	six children; behavioural	to have some fun I have got some perverted	found the appellant	challenged.
	01/03/2017	difficulties from aged 9 yrs.	fantasies'. A police officer posing as a 14 yr-old	believed the person he	

Physically and emotionally abused by his father.

Bullied at school; educated to yr 12; enrolled university course; studies postponed.

Left home aged 17 yrs.

Medicated for depression.

The Psychologist Report noted the appellant displayed features commonly associated with Asperger's Syndrome; including severe problems with social interaction, restricted and repetitive patterns of behaviour and interests and individuals with this disorder can have great difficulty reading non-verbal cues and in determining appropriate interpersonal space.

girl responded and there were regular communications between them of an explicit sexual nature. He offered to buy or give her a new phone to allow further communications. He was arrested when he arrived at a pre-arranged meeting point.

Ct 2

Five images of CEM were found on a thumb drive from Vucemillo's house. Some images appeared to depict female children as young as 7 or 8. The images fell within category 1 of the CEM classification guidelines.

was communicating with was 14 yrs old. He found the appellant had encouraged and sought to persuade her to engage in sexual activity with him.

The sentencing judge accepted the CEM was toward the lower end of the scale of seriousness and that he did not intend to disseminate the images. However the poss of CEM and his communications with a person he believed was 14 yrs demonstrated a sexual interest in underage girls.

No insight or remorse for his offending. Moderate to high risk of reoffending. At [42] ... the symptoms of autism spectrum disorder ... were in substance described in [the] psychological report, in which it was specifically noted that certain of the appellant's attributes were consistent with Asperger's Syndrome. It is evident ... the sentencing judge took those matters into account.

At [44] ... There is nothing in this case to suggest that adequate provision could not or would not be made to prevent the exploitation of the appellant, or that... imprisonment would be much more burdensome on the appellant than it would be for an ordinarily prisoner.

At [52] ... It may be accepted that the appellant's lack of insight and remorse may at least to some extent be attributable to the appellant's mental impairment and it may also be accepted that the appellant's mental impairment means that general deterrence is to be given less weight. ... it is evident that in the circumstances of this case the

					Y
				X	existence of that mental
					impairment increases the need
					for specific deterrence and the
	D 1 577	10 10 10		11 (2)	protection of the public.
3.	Bechara v The	43 yrs at time offending.	4 x Using elec comm to procure a child to engage in	16 mths imp on each	Allowed.
	State of Western	49 years at time sentencing.	sexual activity or expose a child to indec matter.	ct.	
	Australia		2 x Procuring a child U13 yrs to do an indec act.		Appeal concerned length of
		Convicted early PG (20%		TES 4 yrs imp.	sentence and totality principle.
	[2016] WASCA	discount).	The appellant lived in NSW and adopted false		
	77		personas to contact children through an online chat	EFP.	Re-sentenced to 12 mths imp
		Prior criminal history of inciting a	programme.		each ct. Cts 1, 3 and 5 cum and
	Delivered	person U16 yrs to commit an act		The sentencing judge	2, 4 and 6 conc.
	12/05/2016	of indec.	<u>Cts 1 and 2</u>	acknowledged the	
			Using the persona of a 14 yr-old boy the appellant	appellant's	TES 3 yrs imp. EFP.
		Born in Lebanon, immigrated to	communicated online with the victim, a 13 yr-old	cooperation;	(3 yrs 6mths imp. When
		Australia in 1985.	girl. The appellant repeatedly asked her to send	demonstrated remorse	considered with NSW
			naked images of herself or photographs of her	and responsibility for	offence).
		Divorced; single at time of	breasts and vagina. She complied when the	his offending and the	
		offending.	appellant told her he would never speak to her again	hardship imp would	At [55] The appellant offended
			if she did not. The appellant also sent two	create on the appellant	against more than one victim;
		Previously employed by family,	photographs of an erect penis to her.	and his mother.	the offending involved 'real
		but full time career for his elderly			children' who, on occasions,
		mother for a number of years.	<u>Cts 3 - 6</u>		exposed themselves to the
			Under the false persona of a 13 yr-old boy the		appellant and the offending
		Poor health with coronary artery	appellant communicated online with the victims,		was persistent (and the
		and heart related conditions.	two sisters, S aged 11 yrs and T.		relatively unfavourable
		Insulin dependent diabetic.	<u></u>		psychological report).
			The appellant told S and T that he loved them and		
		Psychological evaluation	during their online chats asked them to wear		At [62] The TES when
		concluded a dependent	miniskirts and remove their underwear whilst using		considered with the sentence
		personality disorder and major	webcam.		for the NSW offence
		depressive disorder, plus a low			represented the highest
		level of understanding and	The appellant also asked S to show her breasts and		sentence imposed for this type
		comprehension of his offending or	vagina over webcam and she did so on at least one		of offending when compared
		the consequences of his actions.	occasion when the appellant told her he would		with the sentences imposed in

		1			<i>y</i>
			never speak to her again. The appellant also	X	other cases.
		The appellant was also convicted	attempted to send S a photograph of his penis. He		
		in NSW of producing,	sent to S, moving emoticon pictures showing a		
		disseminating or poss. child	vagina being rubbed and a penis entering a vagina.		
		pornography for material found	During some chats with S the appellant told her he		
		on the same computer; sentenced	was masturbating.	Seculific	
		to 6 mths 24 days imp.			
			On at least ten occasions T complied with the		
			appellant's requests to show him her breasts and		
			vagina on webcam. The appellant recorded her		
			actions and stored images of T's vagina and naked		
			chest on his computer. He sent to T, moving		
			emoticon pictures showing a vagina being rubbed		
			and a figure performing oral sex.		
			Police found on the appellant's computer a 21pg		
			document containing a record of approx 200 girls		
			who he had communicated with electronically.		
2.	D'Rozario v The	30 yrs at time sentencing.	Indictment	Indictment	Dismissed – on papers.
	State of Western		Ct 1: Use elec comm with intent to procure a	Ct 1: 12 mths imp	
	Australia	Convicted after early PG.	person U16 yrs to engage in sexual activity.	Ct 2: 3 yrs imp	At [14] The sentencing judge
			Ct 2: Sex pen of child 13-16 yrs.	Ct 3: 3 yrs imp	identified the agg factors of the
	[2015] WASCA	Criminal history, including	Ct 3: Sex pen of child 13-16 yrs.	Ct 4: 3 yrs imp	indictable offences to include
	171	convictions of use elec comm	Ct 4: Sex pen of child 13-16 yrs.	Ct 5: 3 yrs imp	the appellant's conduct in
		with intent to expose a person	Ct 5: Sex pen of child 13-16 yrs.	Ct 6: 12 mths imp	contacting and grooming the
	Delivered	U16 yrs to indecent material, use	Ct 6: Poss child exploitation material.		victims; the age difference
	02/09/2015	elec comm with intent to procure	Y	Section 32 Notice	between the appellant and the
		a person U13 yrs to engage in	Section 32 Notice	6 mths imp on each of	victims; the appellant's prior
		sexual activity, poss child	Fail to comply with obligations imposed by the	the 11 breaches.	criminal record; that the breach
		pornography and failing to	Community Protection (Offender Reporting) Act		offences involved unreported
		comply with reporting	2004 x 11.	TES 5 yrs imp.	contact with young girls
		obligations.			which, whilst not amounting to
			<u>Ct 1</u>	EFP.	criminal offence, was similar
		Supportive family; supportive	The appellant initiated contact with M, who was		in nature and manner to his
		partner.	aged 15. The appellant and M regularly engaged in		interactions with the victims of

	1	1	T		Y
			telephone and text sex. The appellant was aware of		the indictable offences; and ct
		Completed tertiary studies in	M's age.		1 was committed when the
		business; obtained university			appellant was on parole.
		degree in HR and employed as a	<u>Cts 2-6</u>		
		senior accounts manager from	The appellant initiated contact with K who, to the	SECILLIE	At [15] Mitigating factors
		2009-2013.	appellant's knowledge, was aged 15. Cts 2-5		include an early PG, for which
			involved digital penetration and cunnilingus. The		the trial judge gave 25%
		Attended 11 psychological	offences were representative. Ct 6 related to naked		discount, his qualified
		counselling sessions by time	photographs of K.	Y	cooperation with police at the
		sentencing.			time of his arrest and his
			Section 32 Notice		remorse. The sentencing judge
			The appellant failed to report his unsupervised		also accepted that as a result of
			contact, which was of a sexual nature, with B (aged		his upbringing he was socially
			16), R (aged 14-16), N (aged 16), KC (aged 15-16),		isolated and lacked confidence.
			S (aged 15-16) and J (aged 16). Appellant also		Further, the appellant had not
			failed to report that he had reactivated or set up new		undertaken the sex offenders
			internet and mobile telephone accounts.		treatment programme while in
					custody for his prior offending
			8		or any equivalent programme
					when on parole.
1.	HMN v The State	20-21 yrs at time offending.	Ind BUN50/2014	Ind BUN50/2014 and	Allowed.
	of Western		Use elec comm with intent to expose a person U16	Ind BUN154/2014	
	Australia	Convicted after PG.	yrs to indecent material x 2.	7.5 mths imp (conc)	Resentenced to:
			Use elec comm with intent to procure a person U16	for each offence.	12 mth ISO with programme
	[2015] WASCA	Criminal history.	yrs to engage in sexual activity x 1.		and supervision requirements.
	128		years yegaga an arrana arranay ta ar	Ind BUN67/2012	
		Intellectual disability.	Ind BUN154/2014	Appellant resentenced	At [15] Three psychological
	Delivered		Use elec comm with intent to procure a person U16	to 7.5 mths imp (conc)	reports refer to the
	23/06/2015	Parents have an intellectual	yrs to engage in sexual activity x 3.	for each offence.	appellant's intellectual
		disability; grandmother looked	Use elec comm with intent to expose a person U16		disability, his short-term
		after appellant from age three to	yrs to indecent matter x 1.	TES 7.5 mths imp.	memory difficulties and his
		16; participated in special	,	r*	lack of true understanding and
		education classes in school.	Ind BUN50/2014		comprehension of the
					wrongfulness of his conduct
		At time offending for	The victim was 13 yrs old. The appellant sent		<i>G</i>
	1	1 01111111111111111111111111	1 It is appearant bent	<u> </u>	

BUN50/2014, appellant was serving an 18 mth ISO for four cts of use elec comm with intent to procure a child U13 yrs to engage in sexual activity (BUN67/2012).

Received counselling after ISO; supports were no longer available to appellant at time offending.

numerous sexualised messages on Facebook and by SMS to the victim. The appellant also sent the victim a photograph of his genitals and repeatedly requested she do the same, which she did.

Ind BUN154/2014

These offences involve three victims.

The appellant engaged in conversations on Facebook with a girl who he believed to be 13 yrs old. It was in fact a police officer posing as a child. The appellant repeatedly requested that she take naked photographs of herself to send to him.

The appellant conversed on Facebook and another social media programme with a girl believed to be 15 yrs old. The appellant requested that the victim take a naked photograph of herself and send it to him.

The appellant engaged in highly sexualised conversations on Facebook and other social media programmes with a 13 yr old girl who had a severe learning disability. The appellant repeatedly requested that she take naked photographs of herself and send them to him, which she did.

Ind BUN67/2012 (offences subject of ISO)

The appellant was 19 yrs old and the victim was 12 yrs old. The appellant requested that she participate in sexual activity and they exchanged highly sexualised messages. The appellant also unsuccessfully attempted to make arrangements to

At [22] ...the appellant's disability significantly increases his vulnerability to potential exploitation and assault in a custodial setting. That may cause the appellant to present as a greater risk to the community on his release.

At [28] ... the appellant is an adult only in chronological age. His delayed psychological development and maturity, attributable to his intellectual impairment, is more commensurate with that of the complainants (other that the police officer posing as a child). That reduces the appellant's moral culpability for the offending.

At [29] ... having regard to all sentencing considerations, retribution and punishment should also be given very little weight in the sentencing of the appellant. The most significant sentencing objective is the protection of the public, in particular children. The appellant's risk of reoffending, which is high, is best managed with intensive counselling, support and supervision...

	meet the victim.	
	Transitional Provisions Repealed (14/01/2009)	
	Transitional Provisions Enacted (31/08/2003)	